

Two Japanese Translations of *Finnegans Wake* Compared: Yanase (1991-1993) and Miyata (2004)*

Eishiro Ito

Introduction

Eugene Jolas, et al. proclaimed the “Revolution of the Word” in June 1929. The following two articles of their proclamation appropriately defend and assure James Joyce’s method in *Finnegans Wake*:

6. The literary creator has the right to disintegrate the primal matter of words imposed on him by text-books and dictionaries.
7. He has the right to use words of his own fashioning and to disregard existing grammatical and syntactical laws.(*transition*, 16/17)

Then, how can the “grammatically and syntactically disintegrated text” be translated into another mono-language? Should the translator faithfully put it into

* Special thanks to Prof. EunKyung Chun for her valuable advice and giving me this opportunity.

a disintegrated language even if only a very limited number of readers can understand it? This paper aims to introduce and examine two Japanese translations of *Finnegans Wake*: Naoki Yanase (1991-93) and Kyoko Miyata (2004).

Finnegans Wake has been considered to be “untranslatable” or one of the most difficult books to translate. But now we can enjoy it in many languages-- French, German, Dutch, Japanese and Korean. The principal language of *Finnegans Wake* is doubtlessly English, and most of the dominant languages Joyce used in the text are European. Joyce's knowledge about Asia was very limited, however, he inserted supposedly about 80 Japanese words or elements into *Finnegans Wake*.¹ As Umberto Eco argues in *The Aesthetics of Chaosmos*, “*Finnegans Wake* takes language beyond any boundary of communicability” (Eco 61). Joyce seems to have created the “Joycean language” based on English and a compound from a list of 40 languages around the world (*JJA*63.343). The “Joycean language” is a fertile bed of multilingualism whose ambiguity enables the reader infinitely to interpret each word, phrase and sentence Joyce interweaved in the text. It is very difficult to read *Finnegans Wake*, which always leads the readers to its hermetic linguistic woods. Needless to say, translating the entire text into one single language has been long considered to be almost impossible before Philippe Lavergne’s complete French translation was published in 1982.² Naoki Yanase, the Japanese translator, was challenged to complete his translation into Japanese. Of course some of the rich ambiguity of the original may have been lost, but using a variety of paper and CD-ROM dictionaries he succeeded in conveying the atmosphere and tone of the original. He even created numerous new Japanese words and phrases to translate *Finnegans Wake*. Yanase's translation is a novel in its own right and a great masterpiece of Japanese literature. However, his translation is too esoteric for the general reader: only a

very limited number of academic and patient readers could finish it.

In June 2004, another translator, Kyoko Miyata, published a more readable Japanese translation of *Finnegans Wake*. Her abridged translation, about half the quantity of the original, with her introduction of each chapter and detailed notes for Joycean words (curiously the same 628-pages as the original), is much more understandable than Yanase's, and plays another role for prospective Japanese readers.

EunKyung Chun comments that she likes Miyata's translation since it is more accessible to the general reader: "The accessibility does not mean a "low" level at all; it means the translator considers the readers and tries to find her own way to deliver the content and spirit of *Finnegans Wake* to the readers. Additionally, my father [Ho-Jong Chun, Professor Emeritus of American literature] likes her method of presenting (introducing) *Finnegans Wake* to Japanese readers."³ Her comment exactly points out the major difference of the two translations.

I. Historical Order of Japanese Translations of *Finnegans Wake*

In translation process, translators are expected to "change into another language retaining the sense" (OED 2) and also to convey the original meaning to the readers neatly. In this sense, *Finnegans Wake* has been considered to be "untranslatable" or one of the most difficult books to translate, because it was written in multiple languages. As listed by Joyce, *Finnegans Wake* contains 40 languages including Japanese and Chinese, but how can translators transpose the multilingualism Joyce used or the Joycean compounded words? Of course, translators can abandon Joyce's multilingualism and translate it into a single language to encourage the mono-lingual readers to read *Finnegans Wake*. To do

this, the translator must select the surface meaning of each word and phrase to transcribe it into one language, which is considered to diminish greatly the literary value of the multilingualism Joyce employed in *Finnegans Wake*. Joyce needed to use multilingualism for *Finnegans Wake* to accomplish his final goal, the deconstruction and recreation of English which is not “his language,” as Stephen Dedalus tells in his interior monologue in *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, although it was definitely his native tongue long before he was born.⁴ On the European Continent where not so many people use English as their daily language, Joyce earned his living by teaching English. But his incompatibility or feeling of unbelonging with English language while living on the Continent could be redoubled by the deconstruction.

Finnegans Wake is a work of fiction which consists of deliberately incorrect misspellings. Unlike Chinese characters or “kanji,” which express their meanings with symbols, the alphabetical letters express only how to pronounce the words, which enables us to interpret each word of *FW* infinitely.

Among the many translations, the Korean and Japanese complete translations are unique in not using the Roman alphabet.

Unlike the majority of world languages which normally use the common basic word order, that is, “Subject, Verb and Object,” Korean and Japanese languages belong to the same linguistic group, the Ural-Altaic family which includes Mongolian, Turkish, Hungarian and Finnish which employ the basic word order, “Subject, Object and Verb.” Recent linguistic research, however, has been proving that there is no clear similarity in lexicon among Ural-Altaic languages, but that they are agglutinative languages in word structure using affixes, especially suffixes to the root.

The Japanese written language consists of three elements, “hiragana,” “katakana” and “Kanji” or Chinese characters. “Hiragana” is a much smoother

script, full of loops and curves. There are 46 basic “hiragana” characters, each one having a counterpart in “katakana.” All sounds in the Japanese language can be expressed with just hiragana. After the Meiji Restoration in 1869 the new government impelled the Japanese people through sudden westernization to catch up with the Great Powers of the world. Then people gradually came to use “katakana” for foreign, especially Western words. Chinese characters or “Kanji” is the most complicated script in Japanese. “Kanji” characters are Chinese ideograms and number in the thousands with each one representing a different idea, but most of “kanji” characters have more than one possible reading. So Japanese writers often put what we call “Rubies” or “furigana” onto kanji characters to indicate the right pronunciation for the readers. This complicated writing system, however, enriched Japanese, especially in the translation process, as we will see later.

The history of translating *Finnegans Wake* into Japanese can be traced back to the year 1933. After six more partial translations, Naoki Yanase finished the first complete Japanese translation of *Finnegans Wake* in 1993:

1. Nishiwaki, Junzaburo. *Anna Livia Plurabelle* (FW 196.01-19 & FW213.11-216.05) in *Joyce Shishu (The Poetical Works of James Joyce)*. Tokyo: Daiichi-shobo, 1933.
*Nishiwaki translated it with the guide of C. K. Ogden’s “Basic English” translation.
2. Osawa, Masayoshi, Shigeru Koike, Junnosuke Sawasaki & Motoi Toda. “Shem the Penman” (FW 169.01-170.24) with detailed notes in *Kikan Sekai-Bungaku (World Literature Quarterly)*, No.2, Winter 1966), B1-12. Tokyo: Toyamabo, 1966.
3. Osawa, Masayoshi & Junnosuke Sawasaki. FW I.8 (FW 206.29-207.20), III.1 (FW 418.10-419.08) & IV (FW 627.34-628.16) with detailed notes in Shueisha’s

- “Gendai Shishuu” (“Collection of Modern Poems”) of *Sekai Bungaku Zenshuu* 35 (*The Selected Works of World Literature*, vol.35). Tokyo: Shueisha, 1968.
4. Osawa, Masayoshi, Kyoko Ono, Shigeru Koike & Junnosuke Sawasaki, Kenzo Suzuki & Motoi Toda. *Anna Livia Plurabelle* I ~ VII (FW 196.01-208.05) with detailed notes serialized in *Kikan Pædeia* (*Pædeia Quarterly*, nos.7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 13 & 15). Tokyo: Takeuchi-shoten, 1970-1972.
 5. Suzuki, Yukio, Ryo Nonaka, Koichi Konno, Kayo Fujii, Tazuko Nagasawa & Naoki Yanase. FW 1.1-3, *Finnegan Tetsuyasai sono-I* (*Finnegans Wake* I) (FW 003-074). Tokyo: Tokyodo-shuppan, 1971. *Part of the translation serialized in *Waseda Bungaku* (*Waseda Literature*) from Feb. 1969 to Dec. 1974.
 6. Osawa, Masayoshi, Kyoko Ono, Shigeru Koike, Junnosuke Sawasaki, Kenzo Suzuki & Motoi Toda. 5 fragmental translations of FW (FW 169.01-170.24, FW 206.29-207.20, FW 418.10-419.08, FW 593.01-18 & FW 627.34-628.16) with detailed notes in *Sekai no Bungaku* (*World Literature*) vol.1. Tokyo: Shueisha, 1978. Recollected in *Chikuma Sekai Bungaku-taiei* (*Chikuma Institution of World Literature*) 68: *Joyce II / O'Brien* (Tokyo: Chikumashobo, 1998).
 7. _____. *Anna Livia Plurabelle* (FW 196-216) in *Bungei-zasshi Umi* (*Literary Magazine Umi*), (Dec.1982), 288-305. With some of Joyce's related letters (trans. Masayoshi Osawa) and Osawa's essay (306-328). Recollected in *Chikuma Sekai Bungaku-taiei* (*Chikuma Institution of World Literature*) 68: *Joyce II / O'Brien* (Tokyo: Chikumashobo, 1998).
 8. Yanase, Naoki. *Finnegans Wake* I-II. Tokyo: Kawadeshobo-shinsha, 1991.
_____. *Finnegans Wake* III-IV. Tokyo: Kawadeshobo-shinsha, 1993.
*The paperback edition (3vols.; I, II & III/IV) was published in “Kawade-bunko” by Kawadeshobo-shinsha in January-March 2004.
 9. Miyata, Kyoko. *An Abridged Translation of Finnegans Wake*. Tokyo: Shueisha, 2004.
An abridged translation with detailed notes (628 pages); about half-length of the original text.

A succession of Japanese translators have exerted themselves to translate *Finnegans Wake* into Japanese. Nishiwaki, the first translator, decoded the *Anna Livia* chapter with the guide of C. K. Ogden's "Basic English" translation. The second group, Osawa, Koike, Sawasaki and Toda first decrypted "Shem the Penman" into Japanese with detailed notes. Their method in expressing the multiple meanings of each Joycean phrase is to transfer its surface meaning into readable Japanese text and make endnotes to explain its lower-layered meanings, historical background, etc. The same method was basically employed by the third group led by the late professor Yukio Suzuki. Naoki Yanase first learned of *Finnegans Wake* by joining the reading group, which published the fifth partial translation in 1971. They translated the first three chapters and added footnotes.

After that, Yanase left the group and began to translate *Finnegans Wake* alone in 1986. He published the first half of the translation (Books I and II) in 1991 and the other half (Books III and IV) in 1993; he took seven and a half years to complete the translation. He did not add a translator's note, although he had to make some fragmental notes later at the requests of readers. Although it is still the only complete Japanese translation of *Finnegans Wake*, general readers often complain that it is too difficult to follow the main plot because of the very complex usage of Japanese Yanase employed to express Joyce's multilingualism or multi-layered meanings of each word and phrase of the novel. Probably most readers would give up reading Yanase's translation in the first few pages. Yanase made a great effort to duplicate Joyce's original text into Japanese: but Yanase's new Japanese usage cannot be a Creole to communicate between Joyce and the common Japanese readers.

Kyoko Miyata's style of translation makes it much easier for general readers to access the text as EunKyung Chun suggests. Miyata, impressed with Michel Butor's introduction to the French translation of "Anna Livia Plurabelle," that can

be summarized that “when reading, the reader consciously or unconsciously makes one choice among mass of meanings or words and phrases.”⁵ Then she thought that there is a limit in translating multiple (much more than two or three) meanings of Joycean words into Japanese: so she decided to take care of how to select one (or two) meaning(s) of each word and translate it into the easiest Japanese as she could, and to indicate the ambiguities in notes (Miyata 673).⁶ However, it was not so easy, as she confessed in the afterword of her translation (Miyata 673).

Miyata carefully followed the first layered plot to transcribe it into easy Japanese as best she could and put detailed notes at the foot of each page for the general reader; she explained the (at most three) implications of each entry in order to save paper space. Miyata mainly consulted Bernard Benstock’s “A Working Outline” and also looked through Anthony Burgess’s *A Shorter “Finnegans Wake”* to decide which parts to select to translate for her 628-page-long translation (same as the original text length).⁷ Her translation includes every beginning and ending part of each chapter, and also contains hard-core episodes, important passages to show the novel’s themes and other motifs that Miyata chose. She put her interpretations before and after the translated parts, explaining the meanings and significance, and their context. She hopes that her translation is much more understandable to the general Japanese readers. She wished to *Finnegans Wake*, “as an organic whole, to bring in relief this thin but surely existing flow of narrative.”⁸ She uses Eco’s three phrases from *The Aethetics of Chaosmos* for her translation’s endorsement with his permission: “an enormous ‘world theater,’” “a *clavis universalis*,” and “a ‘mirror’ of the cosmos” (Eco 73).

Since it was published in June 2004, Miyata’s translation has met with a favorable reception by the reading public. She could have translated the whole text, but she selected an abridged form supplemented with her explanations and

summary of the missing parts: to highlight the signposts in the deep linguistic forest for the general reader, although some academic or enthusiastic readers might be discouraged.

II. Distinctive Features of Two Translations

As Yanase explained later in many of his books and interviews, his translation owes greatly to the developments of Japanese word processors and CD-ROM dictionaries. He always referred to the Oxford English Dictionary CD-ROM (2nd edition). Of course he also used many Joycean lexicons:

Yanase's Joycean Lexicons (Most frequently used first)

1. McHugh, Roland: *Annotations to "Finnegans Wake"*
2. Campbell, Joseph and Henry Morton Robinson: *A Skeleton Key to "Finnegans Wake"*
3. Rose, Danis: James Joyce's The Index Manuscript "Finnegans Wake" Holograph Workbook VI.B.46
4. Gordon, John: *"Finnegans Wake": A Plot Summery*
5. Joyce, P.W.: *Irish Names of Places*
6. Scott, Michael, ed.: *Hall's Ireland*
7. Tindall, W. Y.: *A Reader's Guide to "Finnegans Wake"*
8. Hart, Clive: *A Concordance to "Finnegans Wake"*
9. Ó Súilleabháin, Seán: *Irish Wake Amusements*
10. Hayman, David: *A First Draft Version of "Finnegans Wake" (FS 163-64)*

Additionally, his lexicon list includes *A Lexicon of the German in "Finnegans Wake," A Gaelic Lexicon for "Finnegans Wake," A Classical Lexicon for*

"*Finnegans Wake*," *Scandinavian Elements of "Finnegans Wake*," *A Third Census of "Finnegans Wake"* and *A "Finnegans Wake" Gazetteer* (JhJ 21-22). It is notable that his list includes Ó Súilleabháin's *Irish Wake Amusements*: it was first written in Irish as *Caitheamh Aimsire ar Thórraimh* in 1961 and translated by the author in 1967. It explains the various features of the Irish Wake Amusements: story-telling, singing, music, dancing, contests in strength, taunting, mocking, booby traps, and various games like imitative games, catch games, etc.: Needless to say, such Irish wake amusements can be found throughout *Finnegans Wake*. Hall's *Ireland* is about Mr. & Mrs. Hall's tour of 1840 which covers almost all the major sightseeing spots of Ireland at that time. These two books must have inspired Yanase, although Joyce did not actually read them.

Miyata's five Joycean lexicons for her notes:

Miyata used more than a hundred Joycean references including Yanase's translation as listed in her afterword. To make her notes for the readers, she used the following five books:

1. Glasheen, Adaline: *A Third Census of Finnegans Wake*, Northwestern University Press, 1977.
2. McHugh, Roland: *Annotations to Finnegans Wake*, Revised ed., Johns Hopkins University Press, 1991.
3. Campbell, Joseph and Henry Morton Robinson: *A Skeleton Key to Finnegans Wake*, Viking Press, 1944, 1966.
4. Tindall, William York: *A Reader's Guide to Finnegans Wake*, Farrar, Straus & Giroux, 1969.
5. Rose, Danis and John O'Hanlon: *Understanding Finnegans Wake*, Garland Publishing, 1982. (Miyata 5)

It is not fair to Yanase, however, to compare his lexicon list with Miyata's because she translated ten years after Yanase did, and could refer to even Yanase's translation when necessary. Both commonly referred to McHugh's *Annotations to Finnegans Wake*, Campbell & Robinson's *A Skeleton Key to Finnegans Wake* and Tindall's *A Reader's Guide to Finnegans Wake*.

Yanase's translation and Miyata's translation can be contrasted in the following points:

1. "Rubies" or "furigana":

Yanase: Putting "Rubies" or "furigana" onto every Chinese character or "kanji" to indicate the pronunciation and its implication. He tried to express as many multiple meanings as possible in the translation, creating many new Japanese words and using somewhat unusual Chinese characters and "Rubies" (or "furugana") on them. "Rubies" or "furigana" enabled Yanase to add lower layers of meaning to words written in Chinese characters. "Furigana" allowed him to emulate, though not literally reproducing, the puns, double-entendres and allusions that fill every sentence of Joyce's original text.

Miyata: Putting "Rubies" or "furigana" onto some words to indicate the pronunciation and its implication: she explained the implications in the footnotes.

2. Word order:

Yanase: Persistently tried to follow the original word order. It is very difficult for Japanese and Korean translators, because the two languages use another word order (Subject-Object-Verb). Yanase insists that "translators must translate not only the words but also the styles used in the text" (1997, 10).

Miyata: Tried to follow the original word order only if it can be transcribed in

plain Japanese. She seems to have followed it successfully in the first page as we will see later.

3. Sentence length:

Yanase: Basically transposed the original sentence into Japanese with almost the same length. Japanese translations tend to become much longer than the original English texts, because Japanese translators often add some more words to explain the cultural background, etc.

Miyata: Basically transposed the original sentence into plain Japanese with almost the same length if possible. She explained the ambiguities in the footnotes.

4. Sound:

Yanase: Retaining the original sounds as much as possible. His translation holds the original sound to a surprising degree.

Miyata: Tried to reflect the musicality of Joyce's original text upon her translation: "It does not mean I resorted to some poetic devices: I was just loyal to my own internal rhythm. Some critic said he felt he could hear the flow of a river. That was just what I had wished to express," as Miyata said."⁹

5. Suffixes and ending of the sentences:

Yanase: Consciously avoiding repeatedly using the same Japanese suffixes and ending of the sentences. Japanese repeatedly uses the same suffix, but it would often make the translation toneless.

Miyata: Not seeming to have paid special attention to it as Yanase did.

6. Creating new Japanese words:

Yanase: Creating new Japanese words to translate the multiple meanings of

Joycean wordplays, puns, even rhymes and alliterations.

Miyata: Not creating new Japanese words: she only used only plain Japanese words and phrases to make a more understandable translation.

7. Adaptations into Japanese contexts:

Yanase: Adventurously transposing the original cultural contexts and historical backgrounds into Japanese ones.

Miyata: Not transposing them into Japanese ones so much, because she just tried to follow the supposedly main plot.

8. Readability:

Yanase: Most readers cannot understand it without the original text and some Joycean exegeses (McHugh's *Annotations*, etc.). This is why most readers gave up reading it in the first few pages. So, for most Japanese readers, Yanase's translation is literally esoteric, although 35,000 copies of Volume One are said to have been sold in the first publication year.¹⁰

Miyata: Much more readers can understand it without reading the original text. This greatly owes to Miyata's explanation of the main plots, cultural and historical backgrounds. Her summaries for the missing parts successfully light up the supposedly main plot in the dark Joycean forest.

III. First Page of Two Translations Compared

The Following is the first page of the two translations and notes:

3.01: riverrun, past Eve and Adam's, from swerve of shore to bend

Yanase せんそう 川走、イブ・アダム礼盃亭を過ぎ、 く寝る 岸辺 から輪ん曲する
 Senso, Evu- Adamu-reihaitei wo sugi, kuneru kishibe kara wankyokusuru

Miyata 川は流れる。「イブとアダム教会」を過ぎ、弧を描く河岸から 湾曲する
 kawa wa nagareru. "Evu to Adamu-kyokai" wo sugi, ko wo egaku kashi kara wankyoku suru.

3.02: of bay, brings us by a commodius vicus of recirculation back to

Yanase わん こん どう 湾へ、今も度失せぬ めぐ みち 巡り路 を 媚行し、 巡り 戻る は
 wan e, comodou-senu megurimichi wo Vico shi, megurimodoru wa

Miyata 海 へと向かい、再循環する 心地よいヴィーコ・ロードのわきを 進み、
 umi eto mukai, saijunkansuru kokochiyoi Vico Road no waki wo susumi,

3.03: Howth Castle and Environs.

Yanase えいぢい い じょう しゅうえん 栄地四圍 委蛇たるハウス城 と その周円。
 H C E taru Howsu-jo to sono shuen.

Miyata H C E ホース城とその 周辺 へ われらを 連れ戻す。
 Howsu-jo to sono shuen e warera wo turemodosu

3.04: Sir Tristram, violer d'amores, fr'over the short sea, had passen-

Yanase さい・トリストラム、かの 恋 の 怜人が、短調 の 海 を 越え、
 Saa Trisutoramu, kano koi no reijin ga, tancho no umi wo koe,

Miyata ヴィオラ・ダモレを奏でる 愛 の 破戒者さい・トリストラムが、
 viola-damore wo kanaderu ai no hakaisha Saa Trisutoramu ga,

3.05: core rearived from North Armorica on this side the scraggy

Yanase ノース・アルモリカから こちら
 Noosu Arumorika kara kochira

Miyata 孤独 な 半島 性 戦争 を 戦う ために北アルモリカから波立つ 海を越えて
 kodoku na hantou-sei senso wo tatakau tame ni kita Arumorika kara namidatu umi wo koete

3.06: isthmus of Europe Minor to wielderfight his penisolate war: nor

Yanase おう ちきょう おくれ ばや こぐんひつせん
 Yoroppa Mainaa no ogisu chikyo e okurebayase nagara kogunhittsen to,

たび
ふた旅やってきた のは、もうとう に、まだまだ だった。
futatabi yattekita nowa, mou tou ni, madamada datta.

Miyata 岩多き地峡 へふたたびやって来るのはまだのこと、
iwa-ooki chikyo e futatabi yattekuru nowa mada no koto,

3.07: had topsawyer's rocks by the stream Oconee exaggerated themselves

Yanase オコーネー河畔の 頭ソーヤー田舎が うわさうわさと
Oconee- kahan no tou sawyer-danchi ga uwassa-uwassa to

* トップ・ソーヤー
Miyata オコニー川わきに木挽き親方の岩が積み上がって
Oconii-gawa waki ni kibiki-oyakata no iwa ga tumiagatte

3.08: to Laurens County's gorgios while they went doublin their mumper

Yanase ダブリつづけ、ローレンス郡は 常時阿集にふくれあがったのも、
Dabuli-tsuzeuke, Lourensu-gun wa giogiashu ni fukureagatta nomo,

* ジョージア州ロレンス郡となり、ダブリン、ダブリンと非ジプシーの
Miyata giogia-shu Lorensu-gun to nari, Dabulin, Dabulin to hi-jipushii no

3.09: all the time: nor avoice from afire bellowed mishe mishe to

Yanase もうまだだった。遠炎の一声が 吾め割れ目とのたまわって
mou madadatta. En-en no issei ga wareme wareme to notamawatte

Miyata 人口が膨れていくのもまだのこと、情熱の火に煽られた声
jinko ga fukureteiku nomo mada no koto, jonetsu no hi ni aorareta koe ga,

3.10: taufauf thuartpeatrick not yet, though venissoon after, had a

Yanase 汝バトリックの 泥誕を洗礼したのも、もうまだだった。鹿のちに、
nanji Patorikku no deitan wo senreishita nomo, mou mada datta. Shikarunochi ni,
やぎかわ むすこ
山羊皮 息子 が
yagigawa-musuko ga

ミレユミシユタフタフ
Miyata われを洗礼せよ、 汝バトリック、と言うのもまだのこと、
ware wo senrei seyo (mishu mishu tafu tafu), nanji Petorikku, to iu nommo mada no koto,

もう間もないことながら、
mou mamonai kotonagara,

3.11: kidskad buttended a bland old isaac: not yet, though all's fair in

Yanase 若下司のいたりで盲碌 伊作爺さん を食ぶらかしたのも、じきにまだだった。
 wakagesu no itari de mouroku Isaku-jiiisan wo taburakashita nomo, jiki ni mada datta.

Miyata 若造 が老耄アイザックをバットで追い出すのもまだのこと、
 wakazo ga roumou Aizakku wo batto de oidasu nomo mada no koto,

3.12: vanessy, were sosie sesthers wroth with twone nathandjoe. Rot a

Yanase 恋は 発条サというものの、ステラレ姉妹 がふたりでに情ナサン男 に
 Koi wa Vanessa to iumono no, Sutela-re-shimai ga futarideni Jounathan-otoko ni
 いきとお
 憤った のは、まだ だった。
 ikidootta nowa, mada datta.

Miyata ヴァネッサ狂いは手段を選ばず だが、双子星姉妹が
 Vanessa-gurui wa shudan wo erabazu daga, futagosei-shimai (sozi-sesutaazu) ga
 一人で二人相手の 多情ジョナサンに怒る のもまだのこと、
 hitori de futari aite no tajo-Jonasan ni okoru nomo mada no koto,

3.13: peck of pa's malt had Jhem or Shen brewed by arclight and rory

Yanase おやじ ぼくが はつこう あか
 親父の麦芽をちよっぱり醗酵させたのをジェムかシェンがアーク明かりの
 Oyaji no bakuga wo choppiri hakkosasete nowo Jemu ka Shen ga aacu-akari no
 じょうどう お あか
 もとで 醸造し終えろと、赤にじむ
 moto de jouzou-shioeru to, aka-nijimu

Miyata ジェムまたはシェンがパパのモルトをたつぷり箱舟明かり のそばで
 Jemu matawa Shen ga papa no moruto wo tappuri hakobune-akari no soba de
 醸造すると、露 を 帯びた赤い
 jozo suruto, tsuyu wo obita akai (ro ri i)

3.14: end to the regginbrow was to be seen ringsome on the aquaface.

Yanase こうきゆう はし みなも こ
 虹弓の 端 が 水面 に弧つぜんと 見えようとしていた。
 koukyu no hashi ga minamo ni kotsuzen to mieyou to shiteita.

Miyata 虹の 端 が水面 に 環を 描いて見えるのもまだ先のことだった。
 niji no hashi ga suimen ni wa wo egaitte mieru nomo mada saki no kotodatta.

3.15: The fall (bababadalgharaghtakamminarronnkonbronntonner-

Yanase ^{てんらく} 転落 (ババババ ベラガガラババボンブティドッヒャンブティゴゴロ
tenraku (bababababa beragagara baba bonputei dohhyanputei gogoro-
ゴロゲギ カミナロン
gorogegi kaminaron-

Miyata * 落下 (バババダルガラクタカミナロンコンブロントネールロントウオン
rakka (bababa daru garakuta kaminaron konburon to neeru ron tuon

3.16: ronntuonnthunntrovarrhounawnskawntoohooorderenthur-

Yanase コンサンダダンダダ ウォールガガイッテヘヘトールトルルトロンブ
kon san dadan dada uooruru gaga itte hehehe tooru toruru toronbu-
ロンビピッカズゼゾンドドーフダフラクオ オヤジ ジグ
ron bibikkazu zezonn dodooffu dafura fukuo oyaji jigū

Miyata サントロヴァルーノースコーントウーフフルデーネトル
san toro varuunoo sukoon tuufu fuuru deene turu

3.17: nukl) of a once wallstrait oldparr is retaled early in bed and later

Yanase ^{きゅうウォルがい ろうじん おはなし しよじ ねどこ} シャッーン!)、急魚留街の老仁の尾話 は初耳には 寢床 で、のちには
shhauun!), Kyu-Walu-gai no roujin no ohanashi wa shoji niwa nedoko de, nochi niwa

Miyata *^{オールド・パー} スック!)、かつてのウォール街の老いた若鯉 の 落下は、
nukkul), katsute no Walu-gai no oita-wakashake (ouludo-paa) no rakka wa,
早く は 寝物語 に、のちには
hayaku wa nemonogatari ni, nochiniwa

3.18: on life down through all christian minstrelsy. The great fall of the

Yanase ^{いのちなが タン ぎんゆうし かたり つ りへき だいいらく} 命流く キリシ譚 吟遊史 に語り継がれる。 離壁 の 大潰落
inochinagaku Chirisitan-gin-yushi ni katari-tsugareru. Riheki no daikairaku

Miyata * クリスチャンの吟遊詩人 によって語り直される。壁 の 大落下
Curisuchan no gin-yu-shijin ni yotte katari-naosareru. Kabe no dai-rakka

3.19: offwall entailed at such short notice the pftjschute of Finnegan,

Yanase ^{ついおとこ らく} はたちまち にして ごつ墜男 フィネガンのずってーん落 を
wa tachimachi nishite gottuiotoko Finegan no zutteenraku wo

Miyata は即座 にアイルランドの 堅物 男 フィネガンの落下を
 wa sokuza ni airurando no katabutsu-otoko Finegan no rakka wo

3.20: erse solid man, that the humptyhillhead of humself promptly sends

Yanase ま こ ず み は
 巻き込んで、 頭んぐり身 が食むしやらに
 makikonde, zunguri mi ga hamushara ni

Miyata 引き起こし、 *ハンフティ
 ひきおこし、 彼 の瘤山頭 は知りたがり屋をただちに
 hikiokoshi, kare no ryu santou (hamputei) wa shiritagariya wo tadachi ni

3.21: an unquiring one well to the west in quest of his tumptytumtoes:

Yanase せんさく す にし いど むく さか
 浅索 好き を 西へと 井戸 ませ、 無垢っちょあんよを探し にやらせる。
 sensaku zuki wo nishi eto ido-mase, mukuccho an-yo wo sagashi ni yaraseru.

Miyata タンフティ
 小山 の 爪探し へと西 に走らせる。ひっくり返った足の行く先、
 koyama(tamputei) no tsume-sagashi eto nishi ni hashiraseru. Hikuri-kaetta ashi no yukusaki,

3.22: and their upturnpikepointandplace is at the knock out in the park

Yanase し ば てん こうえん ぐう
 するとその ひっくり肢ってん場っ点は公園 の 隅ロッキー、どぶリンの
 Suruto sono hikkuri shitten-batten wa kouen no guurokki, Dobulin no
 う
 初いとしりフィーが く寝って以来、
 u-itoshii Lifii ga kunette irai,

Miyata 通行税取り立て門 は公園のノックゲート、そこではデヴリン人が初めて
 tsuuko-zei toritate-mon wa kouen no nokku-geeto, soko dewa devurin-jin ga hajimete

3.23: where oranges have been laid to rust upon the green since dev-

Yanase よ みどり あか
 オレンジたちが 寄りどりち緑 に 赤 さびるままに
 orenji-tachi ga yoridori-chimidori ni aka-sabiru mama ni

Miyata *
 リヴィを愛して以来、 オレンジがグリーンの上に
 Livi wo aishite irai, orenji ga guriin no ue ni

3.24: linsfirst loved livvy.

Yanase くさ
 い草っているところ。

ikusatte iru tokoro.

Miyata 横たわっている。

yokotawatte iru.

Ito's Notes for Yanase's translation:

Yanase did not put the translator's notes in his translation, although he explained the first paragraph a little in *Finnegans Shinkoki*.¹¹ Yanase printed "ruby" or "kana" along every Chinese character to show pronunciations. His unique usage of Chinese characters corresponds with the Joycean compound words.

[3.01] The first Chinese characters,"川走" (senso) expresses "river+run" which also reminds the Japanese readers of "war" (senso) by its sound. Yanase's translation begins with the new Japanese word "川走" which is not a common Japanese phrase just as "riverrun" is not in any English dictionary except the *OED* as a "nonce-word." As Yanase explains, many wars are described in *Finnegans Wake*, the war between Adam and Eve, between Cain and Abel, between Brian Boru and the Danes, between Napoleon and Wellington, between life and death, between words, between languages, etc (*FS* 95-96). As many Japanese readers often raise a question, "Why did Yanase make this strange Japanese word, while there is no implication for "war" in the original word 'riverrun'?" The answer is: Because Yanase translated not only the word but also Joyce's "style" here: The word "川走" exemplifies how Yanase translated *Finnegans Wake* into Japanese. "礼盃亭" (reihaitei) expresses the double meanings: one is Franciscan church Adam and Eve, Merchants Quay, the other is the site of Adam and Eve tavern or HCE & ALP's pub in Chapelizod:

“礼拝堂” (reihaido: chapel) + “盃” (hai: cup or chalice) + “亭” (tei: bower or tavern).

- [3.02] “今も度失せぬ” (konmodou-senu) retains the original sound “commodius” because it is also a Roman emperor’s name. “巡り路” (megurimichi) retains “vicious circle” and “circular road.” “媚行” (Vico) holds the Italian philosopher Giambattista Vico’s name by the sound and “love action” by the characters. “巡り” (meguri: to circulate) is used twice, and “巡り戻る”(megurimodoru) means “to recirculate.”
- [3.03] “榮地四圍委蛇” (eichi shii ii) is one way of expressing the sound of HCE, literally meaning “the glorious land environing the mild waters.” As you see, however, that does not contain Howth Castle, so Yanase needs to add it to the translated text after the word. “周円”(shuen) suggests “Environs” and its sounds also implies “終焉”(shuen) meaning “ending” or “death.” Here Yanase suggests the circular structure of *Finnegans Wake*, “In the beginning is the end.”
- [3.04] In the Sir Trisutram paragraph, Yanase seems mainly to follow William Tindall’s *A Reader’s Guide to Finnegans Wake*. “かの恋の怜人” (kano koi no reijin) literally means “that wise man of love.” “短調の海” (tancho no umi) means “the sea of minor or moll,” also reflecting McHugh’s nautical note, “short sea: one with close wave”; Yanase also implies that “viola d’amore” or “viol of love” is an old musical instrument. This sentence would have irritated Yanase a little because he cannot follow Joyce’s original word order.
- [3.05] He just describes “North Armórica” (Brittany) and
- [3.06] “Europe Minor” (Ireland) into Japanese script without interpretation.
- [3.06] “弧軍筆戦” (kogunhissen) is his unique expression of “his penisolate war”: 弧(ko: [island] “arc”) which responds “凹ぎす地峡” (ougisu chikyo: scraggy

isthmus), 軍 (gun) = troops: 孤軍[奮闘](kogun[funtou]): to fight a lone hand; 筆(hitsu) = pen > penis 戦(sen: war). “ふた旅” (1. again; 2. to travel again or travel twice) probably suggests “wielderfight: *Ger.* wielderfechten: refigt,” but I am not sure why Yanase used the Chinese character “旅” (to travel) here. “もうとうにまだまだだった”(mou tou ni, madamada datta) echoes “had passencore” (*Fr.* pas encore: not yet). The same phrase appears again in “もうまだだった” (mou mada data: nor had...).

[3.07-08] “topsawyer’s rocks” is translated “頭ソーヤー団地”(tou sawyer-danchi) reflecting Mark Twain’s Tom Sawyer. “頭”(tou) means “head” and “団地”(danchi) is “complex” or “housing estate.” Here Yanase follows *Skeleton Key* to Finnegans Wake’s explanation, “Oddly enough there is a stream Oconee flowing through Laurens County, Georgia, U.S.A., and on the banks of this stream stands Dublin, the county seat” (Campbell 32).

[3.09] “吾め 割れ目” (wareme wareme) reflects St. Bridget’s Irish saying, “Mishe mishe” but Yanase uses different Chinese characters in two ways: 1. “吾め” (wareme: I am); 2. “割れ目” (wareme: woman’s private gap) implying her virginity.

[3.10] “汝パトリック” (nanji Patorikku) literally means “thou art Patrick.” “泥誕” (deitain) also bears two meanings: 1. peat; 2. birth. “洗れした” (senreishita) reflects “baptized” in German as Joyce himself explained in his letter to H. S. Weaver (*Letters* I, 247-48). “麁るのちに” (shikarunochi ni) means “though very soon after” by its sound but Yanase uses the kanji “麁” (shika) which means “venison.” Yanase mainly follows the Irish context (not the Old Testament) that young Parnell (a kid and a cad or cadet) displaced old Isaac Butt in Parliament as leader of the Home Rule Party

(Tindall 31).

- [3.12] Yanase implies the love story of Vanessa, Stella and Jonathan Swift.
- [3.13] “ジェムカシェン” (Jemu ka Shen) includes Shaun and Shem or John Jameson & Son Ltd.
- [3.15] Adam’s fall and Vico’s thunder are embodied in a 101 letter word. This sound is composed of polylingual words for noise and thunder, and for defecation (Tindall 32). Yanase expresses this with the mixture of various onomatopoeias. The original thunder sound includes “Kaminari,” the Japanese word for thunder but does not contain “Humpty-Dumpty,” “wall” and “Oyaji,” the Japanese word for father: those three words are inflected in Yanase’s translation. This is a good example for explaining Yanase’s way of translating *Finnegans Wake*. He often inserts his own word plays. In fact, however, Joyce wrote in his notebook (VI.B.11-13: *JJA* 31.146), “Jishin, Kaminari, Kaji, Oyaji” (earthquake, thunder, fire, father: the four terrible things Japanese people traditionally fear).
- [3.17] Yanase expresses the stock fall in Wall Street in “急魚留街” (KyuWalugai) : “急” (kyu) means “fast or rapid” by the kanji character and “once or old” by the sound; “魚留” (walu) means “fish (parr = young salmon) remaining” by the kanji characters and “Wall” by the sound; “街” means “street.”
- [3.19] “ずってーん落” (zutteenraku: [zutteen: Japanese onomatopoeia for falling or sliding down] + “転落” [tenraku: fall]) applies to “pfijschute” [chute: *F* chute: fall] + onomatopoeia).
- [3.22] “ひっくり肢ってん場っ点” (hikkuri shitten-batten) is “upturn+pike+point+place.”
- [3.23-24] Here Yanase’s translation is marvelous: “since devlinsfirst loved livvy” turns into “どぶリンの初いとしりフィーがく寝って以来”(Dobulin no

u-itoshii Liffi ga kunette irai): “どぶりん” (Dobulin: ditch or Black Pool + Lin); “初い”(ui: “first” by the character + “lovely” by the sound); “リフィー”(Liffey); “く寝って” bears two meanings: 1. “寝る” (neru: to lie or sleep with) and 2. “くねる” (kuneru: to bend); 以来 (irai: since). According to *Classical Lexicons to Finnegans Wake*, the last word “livvy” suggests the Roman historian, Titus Livius. Yanase cannot build this element into his translation. But how can you blame him for it?

Translation of Miyata's notes:

“Kawa wa nagareru (riverrun).” The original text begins with the small letter “r” and links with the last sentence of the text, “Yukute wo hitori saigo ni aisarete kanata e (A way a lone a last a loved a long the).” Just as the sea water becomes a cloud which irrigates the head stream of a river and goes back again to the sea, *Finnegans Wake* has the same axiom of circulation as nature. River Liffey runs through and circulates the whole text floating through the flotsams of the histories of Ireland and the world. River Liffey is alias Anna, and also the heroine's name in the novel.

The locale is Dublin where the Liffey flows: the time setting on Book I, Chapter I is long ago, the Age of God, according to Vico's historical division, when many events had not happened yet. “Not yet” suggests that many events described in this chapter can happen in the future. The events and characters involved with them—Tristan, St. Patrick, Parnell, Swift, Noah and his sons, Shem, Ham and Japheth—referred to in the short paragraphs of the opening page, recurrently appear throughout the text, varying and metamorphosing diversely.

Also in Chapter One, the “four old men,” the prankquean, Finnegan, H. C.

Earwicker and his family, etc., appear. The themes and motifs recurring throughout *Finnegans Wake*, the falls and rebirths of the individual and mankind, wars, sexual crimes, the conflicts between father and son, between brothers, between man and woman, the power struggles, etc., are projected, assuming the characteristic as the overture of the novel.

After stating the locale and the time, the story begins with the fall of thunder and Finnegan the brickmason. Finnegan, after H. C. Earwicker apparently his later self enters the stage, lies long like the legendary giant Finn MacCool assimilating with the landscape of Dublin from Howth Castle and its environs surrounding the bay. The origin of the word “Howth” is derived from the Danish word meaning “head.” The production might be the grand dream of Finnegan who is sleeping with his head on the hill of Howth and his toes on the two hillocks in Phoenix Park. Joyce originally conceived this masterpiece as Finn’s dream, but he changed it as he went along. There is a divergence of views on who dreams *Finnegans Wake*.

[3.01: riverrun] “Kawa wa nagareru”

A noun linked to “the,” the last word of the text; “the stream of a river.” Some scholars point out that it also reflects the French word, “rêver” (to dream); it can be also translated, “Yume nosete kawa wa nagareru” (The river runs with a dream). The river is River Liffey, flowing in Central Dublin, whose fountain is located on a mountain shoulder, about 3 km off from the mountain top of Mt. Kippure, the Wicklow Hills.

[3.01: Eve and Adam’s] “Ivu to Adamu Kyokai”

“Adam and Eve Church” is a Franciscan church in the south side of River Liffey.

[3.02: vicus] “Vico Road”

1. A road along Dublin Bay in Killiney, in the Southeast of Dublin.

2. Vico, Giambattista: an Italian historical philosopher.

[3.04: violer d'amores] "Viola-damore"

A stringed instrument used in the eighteenth century: it consists of five or seven strings and many sympathetic strings.

[3.04: Sir Tristram] "Trisutramu"

1. Tristan in the legend of "Tristan and Isolde" or Tristram in Sir Thomas Malory's *Le Morte d'Arthur*.
2. Sir Amory Tristram, the first earl of Howth; born in Brittany; renamed as St. Lawrence.

[3.05: North Armorica] "Kita Arumorika"

Northwest France; Brittany.

[3.07: the stream Oconee] "Oconi-gawa"

A river flowing in Georgia, US.

[3.08: gorgios] "giogia-shu"

A state in the South of US.

[3.08: dublin] "Dabulin"

Not the capital of Ireland but Dublin, a town along the Oconee, Georgia. Joyce claims that this town was founded by a Dubliner, Peter Sawyer (*Letters I*, 247), but this person remains unaccounted [*Annotations*]. The local history says Jonathan Sawyer named the town (Glasheen [*Third Census*]).

[3.10: -peatrick] "Petricurku"

1. Peter. See the Bible, Matthew 16.18: "thou art Peter." [*Annotations*]
2. St. Patrick (?389-?461), the guardian saint of Ireland. The feast day is March 17. Born in Great Britain and came to Ireland in 432 to propagandize Christianity.

[3.11: kidcad] "wakazo"

1. Charles Stewart Parnell (1846-91), the leader of the movement of Irish

Independence, and of the Irish Parliamentary Party. Driven from the leader's seat because of adultery with Mrs. Kitty O'Shea. As a boy Parnell was called 'Butthead.' [*Annotations*]

[3.11: isaac] "Aizakku"

Isaac Butt (1813-79), a politician, who was ousted from the leadership of the Parliamentary Party by Parnell. [*Annotations*]

[3.12: sosie sesthers] "futagosei-shimai (suzi-sesutaazu)"

Two women related to Jonathan Swift, Esther Johnson (Stella in his works) and Esther Vanhomrigh (Vanessa in his works): "Esther" means a star ("stella" means a star in Latin and Italian).

[3.12: nathandhoe] "Jonasan"

Jonathan Swift (1667-1745); a priest of St. Patrick Cathedral, Dublin and satirist.

[3.13: Jhem] "Jemu"

1. The Bible, Genesis 9.23. Shem [and Japheth] covered the nakedness of their drunken father.
2. John Jameson, a great distiller of Ireland.

[3.13: rory] "tsuyu wo obita akai"

According to Joyce's own glossary (letter dated 26 November 1936) [precisely 15 November 1926; *Letters* I, 248], 1. rory=Irish=red; 2. rory=Latin, roridus=dewy.

It can also imply Rory (Roderick) O'Connor (?1116-98), the last king of Ireland, who failed to fight to repulse the attack of the army of Henry II, King of England.

[3.15: The fall...] "rakka..."

1. Thundersound in multilingualism. Vico connected the thundersound to the primitive men's consciousness of sin: they considered it as a voice of

God.

2. “konnbronn” is associated with Pierre earl de Cambronne, a Napoleon general, who reportedly shouted “Merde!” (“Shit!”) during the battle of Waterloo. Also, it is considered to mix with the sounds of a catharsis and a crepitus.

[3.17: old parr] “oita-wakashake (ouludo-paa)”

Old Parr:

1. Thomas Parr, who was said to have been born in 1482 and died at the age of 152 in Shropshire, England.
2. The whiskey named after Parr.
3. An old par of exchange between homeland and foreign countries: it does not exist in the time of the floating flexible exchange rate system anymore.

[3.18: christian minstrelsy] “Curisuchan no gin-yu-shijin”

Christy Minstrels is a minstrel show troupe (Whites impersonating Blacks in a vaudeville) organized by Edwin P. Christy, an American actor. [*Annotations, Third Census and Kenkyusha's Eng-Jap Dic for Gen. Reader*]

[3.19: Finnegan] “Finegan”

1. Subject of the ballad “Finnegans Wake”: A brickmason fell from the ladder to death but returned to life at the wake when he happened to be steeped in whiskey.
2. Finn MacCool, the Irish legendary hero: Finn led the Knights of Fianna and was a father of Ossian, the focal figure of Macpherson's poem “Ossian”, 1765).

[3.20-21: the humptyhillhead of humself prumpty... in quest of his tumptytumtoes]
 “kobuyama-atama (hamputei) wa... koyama (tamputei) no tsume-sagashi eto...”

Overlapping the landscape of Dublin and the shape of the sleeping giant;

Howth Head is superposed on the giant's head, two hills of Phoenix Park, west of Dublin, are regarded as his toes.

[3.22: the knock out] “nokku-geeto”

Castleknoch Gate, the northeast [precisely “northwest”] gate of Phoenix Park.

[*Annotations*]

[3.24: livvy] “Livi”

River Liffey.[*Gazetteer*]

[3.23: oranges have been laid to rust upon the green] “orenji ga guriin no ue ni yokotawatte iru]

1. Orange and green, with white, are the colors of the national flag of Ireland. Green suggests the aboriginal Irish (mainly Catholics), and orange indicates the planters from England since the seventeenth century (Protestants); white symbolizes the appeasement of the two.
2. The early populators Tuatha De Danann had groups divided by color: orange symbolized the craftsmen like blacksmiths and green the free men without big distinction.
3. Orange Order; an organization founded in Northern Ireland in 1795 to defend Protestants and the King of England.

The above comparison of the first page explains their major differences. Careful readers can easily find the differences of each translator's interpretation word by word. But the major differences come from each translator's method: Yanase tried to transpose the ambiguities only with his translated text as much as possible, while Miyata transposed them by using footnotes to make the Japanese translation as plain as she could.

Conclusion

Even more than ten years after the publication, the assessments of Yanase's translation have yet to come down on one side or the other. Many Japanese Joycean scholars admired his accomplishment while quite a few scholars just ignored it. One of the earliest reactions was Yong-gun Nah's Korean review, in *English Language and Literature*, published by the English Language and Literature Association of Korea in 1992.¹² Yong-gun Nah actually met Yanase in Tokyo to express her admiration. In one interview, Yanase expressed great gratitude towards her (*Eureka*, 406, 102-3).

The Kanto Joyce Study Group, Tokyo, has been reading *Finnegans Wake* for fourteen years and has often examined Yanase's translation word by word to check if something is missing. It can be regarded as Japanese annotations to *Finnegans Wake*, although we always need to look into the original text to understand it very well. In December 1994 when we discussed it in roundtable, we concluded it as the greatest work of Japanese literature, rather than a good translation of *Finnegans Wake*, because of its abstrusity.¹³ His translation deconstructed Japanese as Joyce's original text deconstructed English. It is, however, doubtlessly a great masterpiece in the history of Japanese translation.

So far, at least two Japanese reviews for Miyata's translation can be found, both of which express warm comments for her abridged but readable translation with her helpful summaries of each chapter and supplementary notes for the Joycean words. An abridged readable translation with supplementary explanation explaining the missing parts might be a good way to convey the atmosphere and tone of the original text to the general non-English readers.

Comparing these two translations makes us reconsider what is the role of the translator, and what is an ideal translation. It is not meaningful to decide which is

better, Yanase's translation or Miyata's. Miyata's translation will recruit new Japanese readers of *Finnegans Wake*, and some of them will become students and scholars of James Joyce in the future when they might try to read Yanase's translation again. Yanase's scholarly translation and Miyata's understandable translation may be complementary to each other. Japanese Joyceans can now obtain two great Japanese all-inclusive references of *Finnegans Wake*.

(Iwate Prefectural University, Japan)

Notes

- 1) Cf. Eishiro Ito, "The Japanese Elements of *Finnegans Wake*: 'Jishin, Kaminari, Kaji'"
- 2) Yanase criticized Lavergne's French translation because "... Lavergne put [many] Joycean words in his translation just as they are in the original; he also overlooked some words to translate. He did not show us any advantage to use French in translating FW..." (FS 108)
- 3) EunKyung Chun (Soongsil University, Korea)'s email to Eishiro Ito dated Oct. 9 2004.
- 4) *See A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*: "-The Language [English] in which we are speaking is his before it is mine... His language, so familiar and so foreign, will always be for me an acquired speech. I have not made or accepted its words" (p 182).
- 5) Kyoko Miyata's e-mail to Eishiro Ito dated Nov. 20, 2004: "To sum up, he says in it that, when reading, the reader consciously or unconsciously makes one choice among mass of meanings of words and phrases. It is his (the reader's) own portrait, Butor says, which is left in the tracks of his reading. He implies that the same can be said of translation, especially of a work like *Finnegans Wake*." Cf. also James Joyce, *Finnegans Wake: Fragments Adaptes par Andre du Bouchet, Introduction de Michel Butor, Suivis de Anna Livia Plurabelle*, p.17.
- 6) Cf. Kyoko Ono's book review, "Shoyaku '*Finnegans Wake*,'" 511.
- 7) Kyoko Miyata's e-mail to Eishiro Ito dated Nov. 20, 2004.
- 8) The word "clavis universalis" (universal key") is originally derived from Paolo Rossi's *Clavis Universalis* (Napoli: Ricciardi, 1960) as Eco notes (Eco 90). It suggests the term "used in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries to designate a method or general science which would enable man to see beyond the veil of phenomenal appearances, or the 'shadow of ideas.' And grasp the ideal and

essential structure of reality” (Rossi, preface to 1st ed. xv).

- 9) Cf. Yong-Gyun Nah’s book review, “yanase Naoki trans. James Joyce’s *Finnegans Wake*. Kawade-shobo-shinsha, 1991.” 649.
- 10) See *Finnegans Shinkoki*, pp. 69-70 & 94-97. Most of Yanase’s notes for the translation are found in it. His special comments about the Japanese elements of *Finnegans Wake* are included also in it (50 & 72-73) and in *Jisho wa Joysufulu* (159).
- 11) Cf. his conversation with Inuhiko Yomota titled “Vaabalu/Politikaru na joisu e”(For Verbal/Political Joyce), *Eureka*, vol. 30-9, no.406 (July 1998).
- 12) Cf. “Naoki Yanase: ‘Finnegans Wake’,” *Joycean Japan*, vol. 6, 128-38.

Works Cited

A. English and French

- Benstock, Bernard. *Joyce Again's Wake: An Analysis of Finnegans Wake*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1965.
- Burgess, Anthony. *A Shorter Finnegans Wake*. London: Faber and Faber, 1966.
- Eco, Umberto. *The Aesthetics of Chaosmos: The Middle Ages of James Joyce*. Trans. Ellen Esrock. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1989.
- Glasheen, Adaline. *Third Census of Finnegans Wake: An Index of the Characters and Their Roles*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1977.
- Ito, Eishiro. "The Japanese Elements of *Finnegans Wake*: 'Jishin, Kaminari, Kaji, Oyaji.'" *Joycean Japan* 15 (June 2004): 36-50.
- Joyce, James. *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*. Ed. Hans Walter Gabler. New York: Vintage Books, 1993.
- _____. *Finnegans Wake*. New York: The Viking Press, 1939; rept. 1987.
- _____. *Finnegans Wake*. Trans. Philippe Lavergne. Paris: Gallimard, 1982.
- _____. *Finnegans Wake: Fragments Adaptés par André du Bouchet, Introduction de Michel Butor, Suivis de Anna Livia Plurabelle*. Paris: Gallimard, 1962.
- _____. *The James Joyce Archive [JJA]*, vols. 31 & 63. General ed. Michael Groden. New York & London: Garland Publishing Inc., 1978.
- _____. *Letters of James Joyce*. Vol. I. Ed. Gilbert, Stuart. New York: The Viking Press, 1957.
- _____. *Ulysses*. London: The Bodley Head, 1986.

- McHugh, Roland. *Annotations to Finnegans Wake*. Baltimore & London: The John's Hopkin's University Press, 1991.
- Mink, Louis O. *Finnegans Wake Gazetteer*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1978.
- Muto, Emiko. "James Joyce *Finnegans Wake*. 2 Vols. Translated by Naoki Yanase. Tokyo: Kawade-shobo-Shinsha, 1991 and 1993"(book review). *James Joyce Broadsheet* 47 (June 1997).
- Rose, Danis. *The Textual Diaries of James Joyce*. Dublin: The Lilliput Press, 1995.
- _____ and John O'Hanlon. *Understanding Finnegans Wake: A Guide to the Narrative of James Joyce's Masterpiece*. New York: Garland Publishing, 1982.
- Rossi, Paolo. *Logic and the Art of Memory: The Quest for a Universal Language*. Trans. Stephen Clucas. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2000.
- Sterzinger, Blake Edward. "The Japanese Writing Tutor." <http://members.aol.com/writejapan/>. Accessed: Oct. 5, 2004.
- transition, The*. No.16-17 (June 1929).
- B. Japanese & Korean
- Joyce, James. *Shoyaku Finnegans Wake*. [An Abridged Translation of *Finnegans Wake*.] Trans. Kyoko Miyata. Tokyo: Shueisha, 2004.
- _____. *Finnegans Wake*. Trans. Naoki Yanase. Tokyo: Kawade-shobo-shinsha, 1991-93; pap. 2004.
- Joycean Japan* 6 (June 16, 1995).
- Kondo, Kojin. "Jeimuzu Joisu-cho/ Miyata Kyoko-henyaku, *Shoyaku Finnegans Wake ni yosete*"(book review). *Shukan Dokushojin (Readers' Weekly)* 2550 (August 20, 2004).

- Nah, Yong-Gyun. "Yanase Naoki trans. James Joyce's *Finnegans Wake*. Kawade-shobo-, 1991" (book review). *English Language and Literature*. English Language and Literature Association of Korea 38.3 (1992): 649-53.
- Ono, Kyoko. "Jeimuzu Joisu-saku/ Miyata Kyoko-henyaku, *Shoyaku "Finnegans Wake"* (translation review). *Eigo-Seinen CL*. 8 (November 2004): 511.
- Suzuki, Yukio, ed. *Joyce kara Joyce he (From Joyce to Joyce)*. Tokyo: Tokyodo, 1982.
- Yanase, Naoki. "*Finnegan*" *Shinkoki* ("*Finnegans Wake*," *Translation in Progress*) [FS]. Tokyo: Kawade Shobo-shinsha, 1992.
- _____. *Honyaku wa Jissen dearu (The Object of Translation Is Actual Practice)* [HwJd]. Tokyo: Kawade-shobo-shinsha, 1997.
- _____. *Jisho ha Joysufulu (Let's En-joyce in Dictionaries)* [JhJ]. Tokyo: TBS Britannica, 1994.
- _____. With Inuhiko Yomota. "Verbalu/Politikaru na joisu e"(For Verbal/Political Joyce) *Eureka* 30.406 (July 1998): 82-103.

Abstract

Two Japanese Translations of *Finnegans Wake* Compared: Yanase (1991-1993) and Miyata (2004)

Eishiro Ito

This paper aims to introduce and examine two Japanese translations of *Finnegans Wake* which has been considered to be “untranslatable” or one of the most difficult books to translate. But now we can enjoy it in many languages--French, German, Spanish, Italian, Dutch, Japanese, Korean, etc. The basic language of *FW* is doubtlessly English, and most of the dominant languages are European.

Naoki Yanase, the Japanese translator was challenged to complete his translation into Japanese (1991-1993). Of course some of the rich ambiguity of the original may have been lost, but he made a great effort to convey the atmosphere and tone of the original: he even translated “Joyce’s style” into Japanese. Yanase’s translation is a novel in its own right and a great masterpiece of Japanese literature.

In June 2004, another translator, Kyoko Miyata, published a more readable Japanese translation of *FW*. Her abridged translation (about half the size of the original) with her detailed notes, is much more understandable than Yanase’s, and plays another role for prospective Japanese readers.

Comparing these two Japanese translations, we can understand these two effective methods to convey the ambiguities of Joycean words in *Finnegans Wake* in translation.

■ Key words: translation, readability, multilingualism, compound words, ambiguity